THE KNOWLEDGE BASE OF ENGLISH/LANGUAGE ARTS: VOCABULARY AS A SOURCE

Elfrieda H. Hiebert TextProject

- Knowledge is central to comprehension (Ahmed, Francis, York, Fletcher, Barnes, & Kulesz, 2016).
 - Theoretical models: Graesser, Singer, & Trabasso, 1994; Kintsch,
 1998; van den Broek, Risden, Fletcher, & Thurlow, 1996
 - Empirical research: Anderson, Spiro, & Anderson, 1978; Goetz, Schallert, Reynolds, & Radin, 1983; Anderson, Reynolds, Schallert, & Goetz, 1977; Pearson, Hansen, & Gordon, 1979; Taft & Leslie, 1985; Reutzel & Morgan, 1990; Alexander, Kulikowich, & Schulze, 1994, Chiesi, Spilich, & Voss, 1979: and Gasparinatou & Grigoriadou, 2013)



	Common Core State Standards for Reading	
ELA Standards	CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RL.4.1 Refer to details and examples in a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text. CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RL.4.2 Determine a theme of a story, drama, or poem from details in the text; summarize the text. CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RL.4.3 Describe in depth a character, setting, or event in a story or drama, drawing on specific details in the text (e.g., a character's thoughts, words, or actions).	



Five Boiled Eggs

An Old Turkish Tale retold by Laura S. Sassi

Introduction: Nasreddin Hodja, a character in this story, is familiar in many Turkish legends. "Hodja" means teacher.

Long ago, a poor country boy left home to seek his fortune. Day and night he traveled, stopping to eat at inns along the way. Though he ate sparingly, his money quickly dwindled until, one day, no silver *akches*^{*} remained.

Still, the boy kept walking. Soon, however, his empty belly began to ache. Staggering up to the next inn he saw, he approached the innkeeper.

"Please feed me!" he said. "I don't have any money now, but I promise to pay you as soon as I can."

"I'll see what I can spare," the innkeeper

The famished lad gratefully gobbled every morsel. Then, repeating his promise to pay back the innkeeper, he journeyed on.

Revived by his five-egg breakfast, the boy soon reached a bustling seaport. Intent on finding his fortune, he set sail on the first ship that was leaving the harbor.

Years passed, and the lad prospered. As a sea merchant, he sailed far, stopping in many exotic ports. However, he never forgot his humble beginnings or the money he owed the innkeeper.

When he finally returned home, he stopped by the old roadside inn.

*An akche is a unit of Turkish money.

Five Boiled Eggs: Recognize paraphrase of explicit details about main character in a story





He raised hens from the eggs the innkeeper gave him.



c O

DO

He became a sea merchant and traveled to many places.

-

He learned from the innkeeper how to make his fortune.

He borrowed money to buy a new sailing ship.

Untrapping the past By Natalie Smith	ummies have been buried in Egypt for years. We have learned a lot about a from them. But they have also been quite a p scientists. A mummy is a dead body that has with special chemicals and wrapped in cloth <i>Mummies, p. 4</i>). It was only in the last 15 year figured out how this process worked. But now, with the help of high-tech tools, unraveling more secrets from these ancient r details of their lives are coming to light like r	or thousand ancient Egy ouzzle to been press (see Makin ars that exp scientists a remains. Th never befor	ds of rpt erved ng oerts are ne e. But		
	experts say they are not only learning the past. Mummies may also help exj modern medical mysteries.	What is	s the	article mainly about?	
Solving mummy mysteries could help people today.	Tales of the Dead In the past when scientists studied cut through the body, or unwrap it. I inside a mummy while it is whole.	A (С	Why the ancient Egyptians made mummies	Θ
Unwrapping Past: Recognize m	ain topic of informational	в (С	What the study of mummies can teach us	Θ
article		c (С	Where an ancient Egyptian mummy was found	Θ
		D (С	How researchers unwrap mummies	Θ

Overlap between Topics/Vocabulary of NAEP Passages & a Gr. 4 Core Reading Program

Of the moderately frequent or rare words in either NAEP texts, only one appears in the 2,196 moderately frequent/rare words of a grade-four reading program: *stole*.

Narrative Topics

- A tall tale (Heat Wave)
- Realistic fiction of an immigrant boy getting access to the public library
- Chris Van Allsburg's The Stranger
- A Caribbean version of Cinderella
- Tale of Juan Verdades

Informational Topics

- Wildfires
- Finding the Titanic
- Biography of Gloria Estefan
- Salmon Summer: photo-essay about an Aleut boy at a fishing camp
- Donn Fendler's account of being lost in a mountain storm

PROPOSALS FOR THE KNOWLEDGE BASE OF ELA

E.D. Hirsch, Jr. (*Cultural Literacy,* 1988) & Core Knowledge Curriculum







"Interesting List" Approach (e.g., Hiebert, 2020)

Child-Friendly Title	Content Area	
Making Beautiful Things: Art, Fashion, & Movies	Fine Arts	
Blast from the Past	History	
Designing & Inventing: Engineering & Architecture	Physical Science	
Heroes and Famous People	History/Human Interest	
How Things Work: On Earth & in Space	Physical Science & Astronomy	
Learning About Myself, Friends, & Family	Social and Emotional Learning	
Making and Celebrating Communities	Culture/Civics	
Rhymes and Rhythm: Poetry & Music	Literature and Fine Arts	
Health and Sports	Life Sciences	
Stories We Tell: New & Old	Literature and Social/Emotional Learning	
The Living World: Habitats, Animals, & Weather	Life Sciences	
Travel and Places	Geography	

Another View: Vocabulary as a Means for Developing Background Knowledge

Use of vocabulary to measure knowledge

O'Reilly, Wang, & Sabatini (*Psychological Science*, 2019) gave a background-knowledge test to 3,534 high school students before administering a reading-comprehension test on the topic of ecology. Below the threshold, the relationship between comprehension and knowledge was weak ($\beta = 0.18$), but above the threshold, a strong, positive relation emerged ($\beta = 0.81$).

•Simply using students' performance on six words (e.g., ecosystem, habitat), they were able to correctly identify the great majority of students who were below the knowledge threshold.

Rationale for a Semantic Cluster Approach

- Wright & Cervetti (2017): "There is very limited evidence that direct teaching of word meanings, even long-term, multi-faceted interventions of large numbers of words, can improve generalized comprehension" (p. 203).
 - HOWEVER: two studies did find generalized comprehension effects: Beck, Perfetti, & McKeown (1982); Nelson & Stage (2007)
 - Over a 5-month period, Beck et al. taught 12 semantic clusters, each having to do with critical aspects of narratives: characters, movement, traits, and communication.
 - When 2 clusters were taught over a month-long period (with varying degrees of repetition), a generalized effect for comprehension was not found (McKeown et al., 1985)

A PROOF OF CONCEPT

- 1. What is the distribution of semantic clusters in:
 - A. an archival database of words from elementary texts?
 - B. all words in Common-Core compliant core reading programs (Gr. 3)?
 - C. targeted vocabulary of core reading programs (Gr. 3)?
 - 2. Current instruction:
 - 2a: Does the vocabulary targeted for instruction within lessons represent the themes of the texts?
 - 2b: How are teachers guided in teaching target vocabulary in relation to the theme(s) of text selections?
- 3. What is the nature of the targeted vocabulary of texts within a core reading program when a semantic cluster approach is applied?

- 1. What is the distribution of semantic clusters in:
 - A. an archival database of words in elementary texts?
 - B. all words in Common-Core compliant core reading programs (Gr. 3)?
 - C. targeted vocabulary of core reading programs (Gr. 3)?

■ 2. Current instruction:

- 2a: Does the vocabulary targeted for instruction within lessons represent the themes of the texts?
- 2b: How are teachers guided in teaching target vocabulary in relation to the theme(s) of text selections?

- 1. What is the distribution of semantic clusters in:
 - A. an archival database of words in elementary texts?
 - B. all words in Common-Core compliant core reading programs (Gr. 3)?
 - C. targeted vocabulary of core reading programs (Gr. 3)?
- 2. Current instruction:
 - 2a: Does the vocabulary targeted for instruction within lessons represent the themes of the texts?
 - 2b: How are teachers guided in teaching target vocabulary in relation to the theme(s) of text selections?
- 3. What is the nature of the targeted vocabulary of texts from a core reading program when a semantic cluster approach is applied?

- Question 1a: Marzano & Marzano (1988) database of 7,230 words sorted into 61 superclusters and 12 megaclusters
 - Grade 3, Common Core-compliant core reading programs:
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Journeys (HMH; Baumann et al., 2014),
 - McGraw-Hill Wonders (MH; August et al., 2014), and
 - Scott Foresman Reading Street (SF; Afflerbach et al., 2013).
- Questions 2a and b: Texts selected from the middle of:
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Journeys (HMH; Baumann et al., 2014),
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Into Reading (Ada et al., 2020)
- Question 3: Marzano & Marzano (1988) database augmented with the addition of 7,410 words in the Word Zone Profiler.

Superclusters (Marzano & Marzano, 1988)	Vocabulary Megacluster (Hiebert, 2011)
Feelings/emotion; Attitudinals	EMOTIONS & ATTITUDES
Communication; Mental actions; Senses/perceptions	COMMUNICATION
Nonemotional traits; Physical traits of people; Ownership/possession; Popularity/knownness; Life/survival; Conforming/complexity	TRAITS & SOCIAL RELATIONSHIPS OF CHARACTERS
Occupations; Types of people; Types of groups	CHARACTERS
Action; Motion	ACTION & MOTION
Human body; Clothing	HUMAN BODY
Value/correctness; Similarity/dissimilarity; Cleanliness/uncleanliness; Difficulty/danger; Causality; Size/quantity; Time; Location/direction; Shapes/dimensions; Texture/durability; Color	FEATURES & PHYSICAL ATTRIBUTES OF THINGS/EVENTS/EXPERIENCES
Places where people live; Dwellings/shelter; Rooms, furnishings; Events	PLACES/EVENTS
Animals; Foods; Water/liquids; Land/terrain; Vegetation; Soil/metal/rock; Light; Weather; Mathematics; Temperature/fire; Chemicals; Electricity	NATURAL ENVIRONMENT
Machines/engines/tools; Transportation; Materials	MACHINES
Literature/writing; Money/finance; Sports/recreation; Language; Entertainment/arts	SOCIAL SYSTEMS
Pronouns; Contractions; Auxiliary/Helping verbs	FUNCTION WORDS

- Question 1a: Marzano & Marzano (1988) database of 7,230 words sorted into 61 superclusters and 12 megaclusters
- Questions 1b & 1c: All of the words in texts as well as vocabulary targeted for instruction in three Grade 3, Common Core-compliant core reading programs:
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Journeys (HMH; Baumann et al., 2014),
 - McGraw-Hill Wonders (MH; August et al., 2014), and
 - Scott Foresman Reading Street (SF; Afflerbach et al., 2013).

Houghton Mifflin Harcourt *Journeys* (HMH; Baumann et al., 2014

Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Into Reading (Ada et al., 2020)

Question 3: Marzano & Marzano (1988) database augmented with the addition of 7,410 words in the Word Zone Profiler.

- Question 1a: Marzano & Marzano (1988) database of 7,230 words sorted into 61 superclusters and 12 megaclusters
- Question 1b & 1c: All of the words in texts as well as vocabulary targeted for instruction in three Grade 3, Common Core-compliant core reading programs:
 Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Journeys (HMH; Baumann et al., 2014),
 - McGraw-Hill Wonders (MH; August et al., 2014), and
 - Scott Foresman Reading Street (SF; Afflerbach et al., 2013)
- Questions 2a and b: Texts selected from the middle of:
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt *Journeys* (HMH; Baumann et al., 2014)
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Into Reading (Ada et al., 2020)

Question 3: Marzano & Marzano (1988) database augmented with the addition of 7,410 words in the Word Zone Profiler.

- Question 1a: Marzano & Marzano (1988) database of 7,230 words sorted into 61 superclusters and 12 megaclusters
- Question 1b & 1c: All of the words in texts as well as vocabulary targeted for instruction in three Grade 3, Common Core-compliant core reading programs:
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Journeys (HMH; Baumann et al., 2014),
 - McGraw-Hill Wonders (MH; August et al., 2014), and
 - Scott Foresman Reading Street (SF; Afflerbach et al., 2013).
- Questions 2a and b: Texts selected from the middle of:
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt *Journeys* (HMH; Baumann et al., 2014),
 - Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Into Reading (Ada et al., 2020)
- Question 3: Marzano & Marzano (1988) database augmented with 7,410 words in the Word Zone Profiler applied to words from texts in middle of Houghton Mifflin Harcourt *Journeys* (Baumann et al., 2014),

- 1. What is the distribution of semantic clusters in:
 - A. an archival database of words in elementary texts?
 - B. all words in Common-Core compliant core reading programs (Gr. 3)?
 - C. targeted vocabulary of core reading programs (Gr. 3)?
 - 2. Current instruction:
 - 2a: Does the vocabulary targeted for instruction within lessons represent the themes of the texts?
 - 2b: How are teachers guided in teaching target vocabulary in relation to the theme(s) of text selections?
- 3. What is the nature of the targeted vocabulary of texts within a core reading program when a semantic cluster approach is applied?

Q1a: Distribution of semantic clusters: Archival database of words in elementary texts (Marzano & Marzano, 1988) Green = concrete categories

Green = concrete categories Blue = abstract categories Black = function words



54% of words fall into fairly "concrete" categories characters, natural environment.
44% fall into fairly "abstract" categories—features, attitudes;
2% consist of function words

Q1b: Semantic Clusters in Common-Core compliant core reading programs (Grade 3)

Green = concrete categories Blue = abstract categories Black = function words



Gray = proper names/variant words

Ratio of concrete to abstract is fairly similar to original distribution
Function words remain the same; however: proper names and variant words (e.g., onomatopoeia) account for 11% of words.

Q1c. Semantic clusters in instructional words in core reading programs Green = concrete categories

Blue = abstract categories



Substantially more abstract words than concrete words taught
Within abstract categories, features continue to form the largest category but communication is also substantial

- 1. What is the distribution of semantic clusters in:
 - A. an archival database of words in elementary texts?
 - B. all words in Common-Core compliant core reading programs (Gr. 3)?
 - C. targeted vocabulary of core reading programs (Gr. 3)?

■ 2. Current instruction:

- 2a: Does the vocabulary targeted for instruction within lessons represent the themes of the texts?
- 2b: How are teachers guided in teaching target vocabulary in relation to the theme(s) of text selections?

Q2a: To what degree do targeted words in current core reading programs connect to key concepts? With one another?

Focus Vocabulary (Grade 3.3): HMH *Journeys—Common Core* (2014)

- examined
- peak
- fondly
- steep
- rugged
- mist
- pausing
- pleaded

- Theme: Why are stories from different cultures important?
- Target texts:
 - Yonder Mountain: A Cherokee legend
 - The Trail of Tears

Q2b: How are teachers guided in instructing target words?



TARGET VOCABULARY >> Review

Review with students the Vocabulary in Context Cards on Student Book pp. 466–467. Call on students to read the context sentences and explain how the photograph demonstrates the meaning of the word.

MAKE CONNECTIONS Discuss all of the words using the items below to help students make connections between vocabulary words and their use. L3.5b, L3.6

- What would you do if someone pleaded for help?
- How would you describe a mist in the morning?
- Name some things that are radiant.
- What are some traits that you like in a friend?
- What things from second grade do you remember fondly?
- Name three things you are capable of doing.
- Have you ever climbed a steep hill? What was it like?
- What was the toughest test you have ever endured?
- When have you examined something closely?
- What does a rugged mountain peak look like?
- street?

The Best Worst Day

Dr. Mary Fernandez would often think back fondly on the eventful day that set her on the path to becoming a doctor.

When Mary was a young girl, she and her friends had gone hiking. They left early, while a mist still covered the peak of the hill they hoped to climb. The trail was rugged, with many loose rocks and tree roots, but the girls were having a wonderful time.

After staying with the group for a long time, Mary and her friend Jamie started falling behind. They kept pausing to look at the amazing view that would unexpectedly open up between the dense pine trees. Jamie couldn't help but • What are some reasons for pausing before walking across a but stop to snap pictures of the interesting things growing near the trail. After stopping to look at an enormous mushroom growing on a rotten log, they looked up and saw that the res of their friends were far ahead. The girls took off running, bu the trail was very **steep**. Suddenly, Jamie slipped and fell hard. She yelled in pain.

> Mary examined Jamie's leg. Her foot was twisted at a funny angle, and Jamie pleaded with Mary not to move it. Luckily, their friends had missed them and came back to look for them. Since Jamie could not walk, they decided Mary would stay with her while the others went for help.

Daily Vocabulary Boost

•	Ask students the following questions and discuss their answers.	
	What would it be like to run on a rugged trail?	e
	If you examined a painting, would you be likely to miss important details? Why or why not?	pe fo
	Describe an event that you remember fondly.	st
•	Ask students to explain in their own words the meanings	

Target ocabulary

xamined eak ondly eep

rugged mist pausing pleaded Q3: What is the nature of the targeted vocabulary of texts within a core reading program when a semantic cluster approach is applied?

Narrative: *Yonder Mountain* Informational: "The Trail of Tears"









SUMMARY

- Q1a: The Marzano & Marzano framework captures primary semantic clusters of words in elementary texts.
- Q1b: The Marzano & Marzano framework does not address proper names and linguistic forms such as abbreviations and onomatopoeia.
- Q1c: The words targeted for instruction emphasize words from abstract categories more than from concrete categories (relative to all words in texts).

the primary themes/content of a passage. Q2b: Guidance to teachers supports instruction of each word individually and not in relation to one another or the underlying theme or content.

Q3: There does appear to be sufficient grist within current core reading programs to teach vocabulary that develops at least some background knowledge.

SUMMARY

- Q1a: The Marzano & Marzano framework captures primary semantic clusters of words in elementary texts.
- Q1b: The Marzano & Marzano framework does not address proper names and linguistic forms such as abbreviations and onomatopoeia.
- Q1c: The words targeted for instruction emphasize words from abstract categories more than from concrete categories (relative to all words in texts).
- Q2a: The targeted words do not appear to have been chosen to represent the primary themes/content of a passage.
- Q2b: Guidance to teachers supports instruction of each word individually and not in relation to one another or the underlying theme or content.

23: There does appear to be sufficient grist within current core readin programs to teach vocabulary that develops at least some background (nowledge.

SUMMARY

- Q1a: The Marzano & Marzano framework captures primary semantic clusters of words in elementary texts.
- Q1b: The Marzano & Marzano framework does not address proper names and linguistic forms such as abbreviations and onomatopoeia.
- Q1c: The words targeted for instruction emphasize words from abstract categories more than from concrete categories (relative to all words in texts).
- Q2a: The targeted words do not appear to have been chosen to represent the primary themes/content of a passage.
- Q2b: Guidance to teachers supports instruction of each word individually and not in relation to one another or the underlying theme or content.
- Q3: There does appear to be sufficient grist within current core reading programs to teach vocabulary that develops at least some background knowledge.

QUESTIONS & COMMENTS

QUESTIONS

- 1. Can we ever expect vocabulary instruction/interventions to be reflected in higher levels of comprehension?
 - Wright & Cervetti (2017): "Although this [Beck, Perfetti, & McKeown, 1982] is a promising finding, researchers who employed similar interventions in five more recent studies have not been able to replicate the significant, positive generalized comprehension effects.

	A late (DI IWO Studies
Beck, Perfetti, accomplia rival hermit tyrant virtuoso novice miser philanthr	& McKeown (1982) ce 9e.1 9g.3 9g.4 9g.5 9L.1 9L.1 9m.1 9m.1	 Apthorp, Randel, Cherasaro, Clark, McKeown, & Beck, (2012); similar vocabulary used in Apthorp (2006) anonymous 42h.2 disbanded 33a.3 crucial 26c.1 tactic 2g.8 ingenuity 12k.1 lodged 2v.7. feverishly 5j.3

- If vocabulary instruction does transfer beyond knowledge of taught words and to generalized comprehension, what topics should be emphasized?
 - What is known about the transfer of "knowing how to learn" through developing some areas of knowledge to other, less direct topics?
 - 4. Can large numbers of concrete words be taught with pictures or descriptions?
 - In core reading program: Abstract words (3.7 and lower on a 5point scale) have an age of acquisition of 7.3, while concrete words have an average of acquisition of 6.5.
 - 5. O'Reilly et al. concluded that "The more predictive words were among the highest topically associated words as reflected by naturallanguage-processing-based statistics (Deane, 2012)." Would predictions with the concept vocabulary of narratives be as accurate?

- If vocabulary instruction does transfer beyond knowledge of taught words and to generalized comprehension, what topics should be emphasized?
 - What is known about the transfer of "knowing how to learn" through developing some areas of knowledge to other, less direct topics?
- 3. Do any proper names fit into an ELA vocabulary program?
 - 4. Can large numbers of concrete words be taught with pictures or descriptions?
 - In core reading program: Abstract words (3.7 and lower on a 5point scale) have an age of acquisition of 7.3, while concrete words have an average of acquisition of 6.5.
 - 5. O'Reilly et al. concluded that "The more predictive words were among the highest topically associated words as reflected by naturallanguage-processing-based statistics (Deane, 2012)." Would predictions with the concept vocabulary of narratives be as accurate?

- If vocabulary instruction does transfer beyond knowledge of taught words and to generalized comprehension, what topics should be emphasized?
 - What is known about the transfer of "knowing how to learn" through developing some areas of knowledge to other, less direct topics?
- 3. Do any proper names fit into an ELA vocabulary program?
- 4. Can large numbers of concrete words be taught with pictures or descriptions?
 - In core reading program: Abstract words (3.7 and lower on a 5point scale) have an age of acquisition of 7.3, while concrete words have an average of acquisition of 6.5.



- If vocabulary instruction does transfer beyond knowledge of taught words and to generalized comprehension, what topics should be emphasized?
 - What is known about the transfer of "knowing how to learn" through developing some areas of knowledge to other, less direct topics?
- 3. Do any proper names fit into an ELA vocabulary program?
- 4. Can large numbers of concrete words be taught with pictures or descriptions?
 - In core reading program: Abstract words (3.7 and lower on a 5point scale) have an age of acquisition of 7.3, while concrete words have an average of acquisition of 6.5.
- 5. O'Reilly et al. concluded that "The more predictive words were among the highest topically associated words as reflected by naturallanguage-processing-based statistics (Deane, 2012)." Would predictions with the concept vocabulary of narratives be as accurate?

CONCLUDING COMMENT

- A knowledge-based vocabulary program, using the vocabulary in current texts, could be a first step in increasing the attention to knowledge in ELA periods.
- This approach is one that can be readily applied with current tools and frameworks.

